

CITY AND COUNTY OF SWANSEA

MINUTES OF THE AREA 2 DEVELOPMENT CONTROL COMMITTEE

HELD AT THE COUNCIL CHAMBER, CIVIC CENTRE, SWANSEA ON
TUESDAY, 29 JULY 2014 AT 2.00 PM

PRESENT: Councillor R Francis-Davies (Chair) Presided

Councillor(s)	Councillor(s)	Councillor(s)
J C Bayliss	L James	R J Stanton
N S Bradley	Y V Jardine	G J Tanner
J E Burtonshaw	S M Jones	M Theaker
A C S Colburn	R D Lewis	C M R W D Thomas
D W Cole	P Lloyd (Vice Chair)	M Thomas
A M Cook	K E Marsh	D W W Thomas
W Evans	C L Philpott	
E W Fitzgerald	J A Raynor	

13 **FORMER COUNCILLOR AUDREY CLEMENT**

The Chair referred with great sadness to the recent death of former Councillor Audrey Clement.

All present stood in silence as a mark of respect.

14 **APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE.**

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors BA Clay, JP Curtice, AJ Jones, MH Jones, DJ Lewis, J Newbury, TH Rees, C Richards and RV Smith.

15 **DISCLOSURES OF PERSONAL AND PREJUDICIAL INTERESTS FROM MEMBERS.**

In accordance with the provisions of the Code of Conduct adopted by the City and County of Swansea the following interests were declared:

Councillors JC Bayliss, NS Bradley, JE Burtonshaw, AM Cook, W Evans, EW Fitzgerald, R Francis-Davies, L James, YV Jardine, SM Jones, RD Lewis, P Lloyd, KE Marsh, CL Philpott, JA Raynor, RJ Stanton, M Theaker, CMRWD Thomas & DWW Thomas – Personal – Item 16(2014/0831) – applicant is a fellow Councillor.

Councillor ACS Colburn – Personal – Item 1(2014/0484) – Applicant is my dentist.

Councillors AM Cook, SM Jones & CMRWD Thomas – Personal – Item 18(2014/0869) – I know the applicant.

Councillor DW Cole – Personal – Item 12(2014/0306) – I know the applicant & Item 13(2013/1011) – I have knowledge of the site and have been a conduit between the applicants & officers.

Councillor L James – Personal & Prejudicial – Items 2(2014/0484) & 3(2011/1257) – previous objector to site and left prior to discussion, and Personal – Items 2(2014/0484), 3(2011/1257), 6(2014/0417), 11(2014/0295), 15(2014/0828) and Agenda Item 6(2014/0605) as Member of the Gower Society.

Councillor SM Jones – Personal – Items 12(2014/0306) – I know the applicants.

Councillor RD Lewis – Personal – Agenda Item 6(2014/0605) – I know the neighbours.

Councillor CL Philpott – Personal & Prejudicial – Item 17(2014/0844) – Applicant is a fellow school governor and left prior to discussion.

Councillor GJ Tanner - Personal & Prejudicial – Items 2(2014/0484) & 3(2011/1257) – I am a campaigner for animal welfare, oppose the caging of chickens and have previously demonstrated against the industry and left prior to discussion.

Councillor M Thomas – Personal – Item 11(2014/0295) – I know the applicant & objector and Item 12(2014/0306) – I know the applicant and Personal & Prejudicial – Item 16(2014/0831) I am the applicant and left prior to discussion.

G Borsden – Personal - Item 11(2014/0295) – I know the applicant.

16 **MINUTES.**

RESOLVED that the Minutes of the Meeting of the Area 2 Development Control Committee held on 1 July 2014 be approved as a correct record.

17 **ITEMS FOR DEFERRAL / WITHDRAWAL.**

None.

18 **DETERMINATION OF PLANNING APPLICATIONS UNDER THE TOWN AND COUNTRY PLANNING ACT 1990.**

The Head of Economic Regeneration & Planning submitted a series of planning applications.

Amendments to this schedule were reported and are indicated below by (#).

RESOLVED that:

(1) the undermentioned planning application **BE APPROVED** subject to the conditions in the report and/or indicated below:

#(Item 1) Planning Application No.2014/0484

Detached dwelling (outline) at Middle Farm, Fairwood Lane, Upper Killay, Swansea.

Mr Oliver (objector) addressed the committee.

Report updated as follows:

Page 19 – final paragraph – the report refers to “Welsh Walter”. This should be “Welsh Water”

#(Item 2) Planning Application No.2011/1257

Variation of condition 7 of planning permission 2009/1410 granted on 18th March 2010 to allow an increase in the number of laying birds to be accommodated within the buildings to 400,000 at Kittle Hill Poultry Farm, Kittle, Swansea.

Mr Tomlin(agent) addressed the committee.

Two further letters of objection raising animal welfare issues.

Report updated as follows:

Page 36 – remove reference to Councillor Lynda James as she did not call in the application

Pages 33 – 10th para – amended sentence “The assessment was carried using detailed modeling which demonstrated that the newly constructed building holding 400,000 birds will produce lower emissions than the original building containing 295,680 birds.”

Page 39 - 2nd para amend the sentence as above.

Page 40 – amend detailed wording of conditions as follows:

1. Within 12 months from the date of this planning permission a scheme for the landscaping of the site shall be carried out in accordance with details which shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. Any trees or shrubs planted in accordance with this condition which are removed, die, become seriously diseased within five years of planting shall be replaced by trees or shrubs of similar size and species to those originally required to be planted.

2. Within 12 months from the date of this planning permission or prior to the commencement of the development hereby approved (whichever is the sooner) a Travel Plan shall be implemented in accordance with details which shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The Travel Plan shall include details of car reduction initiatives and methods of monitoring, review and adjustment where necessary. The plan shall also include for the control of Service delivery vehicles into and out from the site including the direction of travel. Advice on Travel Plans can be obtained from Jayne Cornelius, SWWITCH Travel Plan Co-ordinator Tel 07796 275711.

3. The total number of laying birds to be accommodated within the buildings hereby permitted shall not exceed 400,000.

#(Item 3) Planning Application No.2011/0069

Retention of eight silos and water silos (Amended plans and description at Kittle Hill Poultry Farm, Kittle, Swansea.

Mr Tomlin(agent) addressed the committee.

Report updated as follows:

Page 47 - remove reference to Councillor Lynda James as she did not call in the application.

Amendments to condition 1:

Second sentence"The landscaping scheme shall be completed within 12 months from the date of this permission".....

#(Item 4) Planning Application No.2014/0621

Use of existing residential field studies centre to include an activity centre, residential activity courses, events venue and siting of a tepee at Stouthall, Reynoldston, Swansea.

Miss Butcher(agent) addressed the committee.

Report updated as follows:

Page 59, 7th paragraph – delete final sentence.

#(Item 5) Planning Application No.2014/0619

Renovation of full interior including repairing walls, painting throughout, remodelling of bathrooms, demolition of partition wall, new door openings, reinstate lift, repair staircase, installation of kitchen, new chandeliers, repair bookcase and new flooring (application for Listed Building Consent) at Stouthall, Reynoldston, Swansea.

Miss Butcher(agent) addressed the committee.

Application approved and referred to CADW.

#(Item 7) Planning Application No.2011/1546

Detached dwelling at Land adjacent to 34 Southward Lane, Newton, Swansea.

Mrs Perkins(objector) & Mrs Johnson(applicant) addressed the committee.

A visual presentation was given.

#(Item 10) Planning Application No.2014/0223

Detached dwelling and part two storey part single storey rear extension and front canopy to No 86 Saunders Way, Sketty, Swansea.

Mrs Foster(applicant) addressed the committee.

Report updated as follows:

A separate planning permission 2014/0826 has been granted for the extensions to No 86 - Part two storey part single storey rear extension and front canopy – Granted on 11 July 2014.

Additional condition added:

The landscaping along the northern boundary of the site shall be retained and thereafter maintained in accordance with details which shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority prior to the commencement of development.

Reason: In the interests of the visual amenities of the areas.

#(Item 11) Planning Application No.2014/0295

Retention of agricultural building at Land rear of 62 Station Road, Llanmorlais, Swansea.

A visual presentation was given.

#(Item 14) Planning Application No.2014/0694

Two storey side/rear extension at 6 Plas Y Fforest, Penllergaer, Swansea.

A visual presentation was given.

(Item 15) Planning Application No.2014/0694

Part single storey/part two storey rear/side extension and detached garage at Cleveland, Llangennith, Swansea.

(Item 16) Planning Application No.2014/0831

Single storey rear extension at Cefn Parc, Banc Bach, Penclawdd, Swansea.

(Item 17) Planning Application No.2014/0844

Rear porch extension, with increase in ridge height of existing garage roof to 7.1m and installation of rooflight to rear garage roof to provide storage in the roof void (amendment to planning permission 2003/2266 granted 30th December 2003) at 3 Mandinam Park, Sketty, Swansea

(Item 18) Planning Application No.2014/0869

Two storey and single storey side extension, single storey rear extension and addition of first floor side window at 3 Ddol Road, Dunvant, Swansea.

2) The undermentioned planning applications **BE REFUSED** for the reasons indicated in the report and/or below:

#(Item 8) Planning Application No.2014/0507

Retention of front boundary wall/fence and increased land level of rear garden by 0.4m at 1 Silver Close, West Cross, Swansea.

Mrs Evans & Mr Facey(objectors) and Mr Ismail(applicant) addressed the committee.

Additional reason for refusal added as follows:

The increase in land level at the rear has resulted in an unacceptable overbearing and overshadowing impact which is detrimental to residential amenities of the occupier of No. 1 Alderway contrary to the provisions of Policies EV1 and HC7 of the Unitary Development Plan and the principles of the Supplementary Planning Guidance document entitled 'A Design Guide for Householder Development'.

#(Item 9) Planning Application No.2014/0571

Change of use from vacant petrol filling station to a hand car wash and valet and installation of covered canopy area at Former petrol station, Eversley Road, Sketty, Swansea.

Application refused contrary to officer recommendation for the following reasons:-
The proposed development by virtue of its nature would have an unacceptable impact upon the physical and water environment and would be detrimental to general highway safety contrary to the provisions of Policies EV1, EV2 and EV35 of the City and County of Swansea Unitary Development Plan (2008).

(3) the undermentioned planning applications **BE REFERRED** to the Development Management and Control Committee as a departure from the Development Plan with a recommendation that planning permission be approved, subject to the conditions outlined in the report and/or indicated below:

#(Item 6) Planning Application No.2014/0417

Construction of 14 no. residential dwellings and associated works at Land off Monksland Road, Scurlage, Gower, Swansea.

Mr Fisher(objector) addressed the committee.

A visual presentation was given.

Report updated as follows:

Page 89 – Recommendation : the word 'ad' should be replaced with 'as' in front of 'a departure'.

Page 90 – condition 6 first sentence should read:

'the site shall be retained and thereafter maintained in accordance with a maintenance and management scheme which shall be....

#(Item 12) Planning Application No.2014/0306

Construction of a single storey changing room building, one full size rugby pitch, one training pitch, a 36 space car park and installation of 11 x 15m high floodlighting columns at Land to the South of Ffordd Cae Duke, Loughor, Swansea.

A visual presentation was given.

Report updated as follows:

Three late letters of support have been received and one petition of support (449 signatures) has been received.

Support comments –

- Loughor Rugby club to a very good job in the local community and should be supported by both Members and Officers
- The facility is long overdue for the youngsters in Loughor
- We have lived in Heritage Park since 2000 and our home was purchased in the full knowledge that the former colliery tip was to be a sports field.
- A field where our local children can safely play sport is preferable to the site being used for housing.
- We note the comments and objections from other residents regarding the traffic, which indeed at peak times are concerning, however it is our understanding that the facilities will be used at off peak times and in our view will not add to the traffic at these busy times.

Petition (449 signatures) –

- We the undersigned confirm our support of the application by Loughor Rugby Club, a club rooted in its community seeking to provide proper facilities for the young people of Loughor

One additional letter of objection has been received from Barratts Homes regarding the site boundary and land ownership. In addition they believe that the proposal does not represent a viable or realistic use of the land and that the proposal would bear a detrimental impact upon acknowledged importance.

One additional letter of objection from a local resident has been received – concerns raised

1. Further to my comments registered online when the application was made I have since had a visit from a representative of Loughor Rugby Club and can honestly say I'm even more concerned about this development.
2. The representative from the Rugby Club confirmed the facilities would be used by over two hundred members making in my opinion the proposed parking inadequate and the increased weekly traffic unsuitable for this small residential estate.
3. I also asked the question if the playing/training facilities would be open to the public and the answer was unsurprisingly no. The residents appear to be making all the sacrifices with this development without any benefit.
4. I don't feel there will ever be a decent relationship between the club and the residents if the uncompromising and high pressured visit I had from the club wanting my support is anything to go by,

Pages 142 and 143 - Site History - remove two items which do not relate to this site : LV/78/0415/02 – Light industry and LV/83/0235/04 – Renewal of consent for joinery workshop.

Page 153 – 5th para – reference is made the full size pitch being 8.5m lower than the existing houses – this should be 6.5m lower. In the same para, reference is made to

the smaller pitch being 14m lower than the existing houses – this should be 7m lower.

Page 154 – 1st para – reference is made to the southern section of the site being increased in height between 5 - 6m. This should be 3 - 4m. In the same para reference is made to the northern section being lowered by 8.5 -14m. This should be 6.5 - 7m

Page 157 – 1st para – reference is made to the 11 lighting columns being located between 8.5 - 14m below the level of the existing houses. This should be 6.5 - 7m.

Page 158 – 4th para – reference is made to the flood lights to the larger pitch being 14.5m lower than the 22 and 23 Ffordd Cae Duke – this should be 6.5m lower. In the same para reference is made to the floodlights to the smaller pitch being 8m lower than 11 Harding Close – this should be 7m.

Page 158 – final para – reference is made to the southern section being increased in height between 5-6m – this should be 3 - 4m.

Page 159 – 2nd para – reference is made to the garden of plot 34 being 6m lower – this should be 4m lower.

Page 159 – 3rd para – reference is made to plot 17 being 5m lower – this should be 3m lower. Also the 45 degree slope should be a 40 degree slope.

Additional Condition

The proposed materials for the roof of the changing room building are not approved as part of the planning permission and the roof of the building shall be finished in accordance with details which shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority prior to the commencement of any works on the construction of the changing room building.

Reason

The proposed materials are not regarded as acceptable in the interests of visual amenity.

#(Item 13) Planning Application No.2013/1011

Change of use of chapel (Class D1) to residential dwelling (Class C3) with two storey side and two storey rear extensions at Seion Chapel, Pentre Road, Grovesend, Swansea.

Mr Griffiths(agent) addressed the committee.

The report was updated as follows:

Page 176, first para – the site is not within a designated green wedge.

Application approved contrary to officer recommendation for the following reasons:-
On the grounds that the proposal would enhance the visual amenities of the area.

19 **PLANNING APPLICATION NO.2014/0605 - CONVERSION OF REDUNDANT LONG HOUSE TO FORM A HOLIDAY LET AND SINGLE STOREY FRONT EXTENSION AT THE LONG HOUSE, STAVEL HAGAR, LLANRHIDIAN, SWANSEA.**

The Head of Economic Regeneration and Planning presented a report outlining the application for the conversion of redundant long house to form a holiday let and single storey front extension at The Long House, Stavel Hagar, Llanrhidian, Swansea.

The matter had been reported to the Area 2 development Control Committee held on 1 July 2014 but was deferred under the two stage voting process for further officer advice on reasons for refusal on flood risk grounds and for further comment from NRW on grounds that the Authority was not willing to accept a 50 year lifetime of development for this application.

NRW had advised that as the flood risk to the site is tidal, climate change has to be taken into account and that only a "50 year lifetime of development" has been considered by the applicant when applying climate change factors. Although NRW raise no objection to the application they advise that for residential development a "100 year lifetime of development" should be considered for climate change purposes.

Mr Baldrain(applicant) addressed the committee.

RESOLVED that the application **BE APPROVED** subject to conditions outlined in the report to the Area 2 Development Control Committee on the 1 July 2014.

The meeting ended at 5.17 pm

CHAIR